

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ד – בהמה המקשה

דף עד – Daf 74

1. *Shechting* an עובר while it is in the mother's womb

Rav Hoshaya inquired: ושחט בן ט' חי – *and shechted a nine-month live fetus*, and the fetus was removed while the mother was alive, is the *shechitah* valid? This question can be asked according to both opinions (below) regarding whether a בן פקועה (a live fetus removed from a *shechted* mother) requires its own *shechitah*: Although Rebbe Meir says in the next Mishnah that a בן פקועה requires its own *shechitah* (and *shechting* it is effective), that may be only היכא דיצא לאויר העולם – *where* [the fetus] eventually emerged to the open air and became an independent entity, אבל במעי אמו – *but* while it is still in its mother's womb, *shechting* the fetus may not permit it. On the other hand, although the Rabbonon say that a בן פקועה normally does not require its own *shechitah* (and *shechting* it is ineffective), perhaps רחמנא ביה – *Hashem validated four pipes for* [*shechting* a בן פקועה], i.e., that Hashem allowed permitting a בן פקועה by *shechting* either its mother's סימנים or its own סימנים.

2. *Machlokes* about "בן פקועה": whether the mother's *shechitah* permits its fetus

The next Mishnah states that if one *shechts* a pregnant animal and finds in it an eight-month fetus (which is nonviable), or a dead nine-month fetus, קורעו – all Tannaim agree *he may tear* [the fetus] and eat it without *shechitah* (however, he must remove its blood). If there was a nine-month live fetus in it, Rebbe Meir says it requires *shechitah*, and is subject to the prohibition of "אותו ואת בנו" – *shechting it and its offspring* on the same day. The Chochomim say: שחיטת אמו מטהרתו – *its mother's shechitah purifies it* for consumption, and it does not require its own *shechitah*. Rebbe Shimon Shezuri says that even if this fetus was four or five years old and plowing in the field, it may be eaten without *shechitah* (his opinion will be explained on the next Daf). The Gemara adds that these Tannaim also disagree whether one may consume the גיד הנשה and חלב of the fetus whose mother was *shechted*. However, all agree regarding רובעו – *having relations with it*, וחורש בו – *and plowing with it* with another species, it is considered a normal animal and forbidden.

2. Can one redeem a firstborn donkey with a בן פקועה?

The Gemara asks: מהו לפדות בן פקועה – *can one redeem a firstborn donkey with a בן פקועה*? The Gemara clarifies that according to Rebbe Meir, that a בן פקועה requires *shechitah*, שה מעליא הוא – *it is a-fledged* [lamb or kid], and certainly may be used to redeem a פטר חמור. The question is relevant according to the Rabbonon, who hold its mother's *shechitah* permits its consumption without its own *shechitah*. Do we say כבשרא בדיקולא הוא – *it is like meat in a pot*, and may not be used for redeeming a פטר חמור? Or do we say כיון דרהיט ואזיל ורהיט ואתי – *since it runs back and forth*, שה קרינא ביה – *we call it a "שה"*, and it may be used for פדיון? Mar Zutra says one may not redeem with it, and Rav Ashi says פודין. Rav Ashi asked Mar Zutra that if his reason for disqualifying it was based on a *gezeirah shavah* ("שה שה") from *korban pesach*, then he should likewise require an unblemished male within its first year!? Mar Zutra replied that the repetitive "תפדה תפדה" – *redeem, redeem* validates any שה for redemption. Still, a בן פקועה is excluded by the above גזירה שוה from *korban pesach*.

Siman – Witness

The men on their way to **witness** the amazing feat of **someone *shechting* an animal while still in the womb**, were about to stop and **eat a בן פקועה** for lunch **without *shechting* it**, when a man asked them to please let him **use it to redeem his firstborn donkey**.

דף ע"ד | DAF 74

Witness



The men on their way to **witness** the amazing feat of **someone shechting** an animal while still in the womb, were about to stop and **eat** a **פקועה בן** for lunch without **shechting** it, when a man asked them to please let him **use** it to **redeem** his firstborn donkey. .

3 things to remember

1. **Shechting** an עובר while it is in the mother's womb
2. **Machlokes** about "בן פקועה" whether the mother's **shechitah** permits its fetus
3. Can one redeem a firstborn donkey with a **פקועה בן**?

